

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

File No. 11

Ministry of Expt. App.
Department of
Cast Am. in SECTION

Volume

PLATO FOLDERI-II

NOTES/CORRESPONDENCE

Subject

Ques. in Parliament on Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

Indexed on

Initials

Record A/B
Record C. Destroy in

To be noted in Sectional Note Book
Not to be noted

Initials of S. O./Supdt.

Initials of Clerk

174137

Previous References



Later References

Keep
O.S.M
15/12/15



IN LOK SABHA

1965, 1966 and 1967 and 1968 and
1969

1. Starred Q.No.623 answered on 29-3-65 asking whether the P.M. told pressmen at Varanasi on 27-12-64 that Govt. would investigate whether Netaji was alive and whether Shaulmarhi Ashram Sadhu was Netaji.
2. Starred Question No.729 answered on 20-9-65 regarding resolution passed by Calcutta High Court Bar Association demanding a thorough enquiry into the mystery of death of Netaji and asking for truth about late P.M.'s letters to Shri S.C. Bose that no precise data about Netaji's death is available.
3. Unstarred Question No.2105 answered on 14.3.66 regarding statement by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose in February 1966 at Madurai that Netaji is alive and that he would come in March, 1966.
4. Unstarred Question No.855 answered on 1-8-66 regarding setting up a Commission by the Govt. of Formosa to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
5. Starred Question No.222 answered on 3-4-67 regarding the statement of the retired Japanese Lt. General Fujiwara about a probe into the circumstances surrounding the death of Netaji.
6. Unstarred Q.No.4338 answered on 3.7.67 regarding Taiwan Government's assurance to co-operate in carrying out investigations at Taiwan where Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose is reported to have met his death in air-crash.
7. Starred Question No.1334 answered on 24-7-67 regarding non-visit to Taiwan by the Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaj Khan and demand for fresh enquiry in co-operation with the Government of Taiwan.
8. Starred Question No.582 answered on 11-12-67 regarding Late Prime Minister Jawaharlal Nehru's letter of 13/5/62 to Shri Suresh Chandra Bose expressing inability to send precise proof of the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose; and subsequent letter to Shri Amiya Nath Bose about desirability of reaching a finality about Netaji's death.
9. Unstarred Q.No.3719 answered on 11-12-67 regarding General Fujiwara's statement in Calcutta about Japanese co-operation if Govt. of India make any effort to arrive at a finality about Netaji's mystery; H.V. Kamath's visit to Formosa, his statement regarding enquiry being conducted by the Formosa Government about the reported plane crash involving Netaji at Taipeh in 1945.

10. Unstarred Q.No.1408 answered on 21-2-69 regarding demand by a large number of MPs for a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
11. Unstarred Q.No.5150 dated 2-4-69 by Shri Samar Guha and Shri Beni Shanker Sharma regarding escape of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Singapore.
Assurance given and subsequently a statement was sent to Department of Parliamentary Affairs, vide C/125/5/69/JP dated 26-7-69 in fulfilment of the Assurance.
12. Unstarred Q.No.4192 answered on 20-8-69 regarding a reported broadcast by Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Radio Moscow.

RAJYA SABHA

1. Starred Q.No.325 answered on 29/2/68 regarding Memorandum by 350 MPs demanding fresh inquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
2. Starred Q.No.284 answered on 17-5-66 regarding statement made by Shri Dwijendra Nath Bose that Netaji was alive and that he would come to India in March, 1966.
3. Unstarred Q.No.265 answered on 2-8-66 regarding setting up of a Committee by the Government of Formosa to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
4. Starred Q.No.51, answered on 17-8-65 regarding statement made by Dr. S.N. Sinha, a former M.P., in Calcutta that Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had been kept in Cell No.46 in a prison in Siberia.

Government of India have already stated in the Parliament several times, in answers to Questions detailed above, that the findings of the Netaji Enquiry Committee, headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, submitted to the Government in 1956 have been accepted by the Government and that there was no necessity to institute a fresh enquiry since the report was conclusive.

IN LOK SABHA

1965, 1966 and 1967 and 1968 and 1969

1. Starred Q.No.623 answered on 29-3-65 asking whether the P.M. told pressmen at Varanasi on 27-12-64 that Govt. would investigate whether Netaji was alive and whether Shaulmarhi Ashram Sadhu was Netaji.
2. Starred Question No.729 answered on 20-9-65 regarding resolution passed by Calcutta High Court Bar Association demanding a thorough enquiry into the mystery of death of Netaji and asking for truth about late P.M.'s letters to Shri S.C. Bose that no precise data about Netaji's death is available.
3. Unstarred Question No.2105 answered on 14.3.66 regarding statement by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose in February 1966 at Madurai that Netaji is alive and that he would come in March, 1966.
4. Unstarred Question No.855 answered on 1-8-66 regarding setting up a Commission by the Govt. of Formosa to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
5. Starred Question No.228 answered on 3-4-67 regarding the statement of the retired Japanese Lt. General Fujiwara about a probe into the circumstances surrounding the death of Netaji.
6. Unstarred Q.No.4338 answered on 3.7.67 regarding Taiwan Government's assurance to co-operate in carrying out investigations at Taiwan where Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose is reported to have met his death in air-crash.
7. Starred Question No.1334 answered on 24-7-67 regarding non-visit to Taiwan by the Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaj Khan and demand for fresh enquiry in co-operation with the Government of Taiwan.
8. Starred Question No.582 answered on 11-12-67 regarding Late Prime Minister Jawaharlal Nehru's letter of 13/5/62 to Shri Suresh Chandra Bose expressing inability to send precise proof of the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose; and subsequent letter to Shri Amiya Nath Bose about desirability of reaching a finality about Netaji's death.
9. Unstarred Q.No.3719 answered on 11-12-67 regarding General Fujiwara's statement in Calcutta about Japanese co-operation if Govt. of India make any effort to arrive at a finality about Netaji's mystery; H.V. Kamath's visit to Formosa, his statement regarding enquiry being conducted by the Formosa Government about the reported plane crash involving Netaji at Taipeh in 1945.

10. Unstarred Q.No.1408 answered on 21-2-69 regarding demand by a large number of MPs for a fresh enquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
11. Unstarred Q.No.5150 dated 2-4-69 by Shri Samar Guha and Shri Beni Shanker Sharma regarding escape of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Singapore.
Assurance given and subsequently a statement was sent to Department of Parliamentary Affairs, vide C/125/5/69/JP dated 26-7-69 in fulfilment of the Assurance.
12. Unstarred Q.No.4192 answered on 20-8-69 regarding a reported broadcast by Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Radio Moscow.

RAJYA SABHA

1. Starred Q.No.325 answered on 29/2/68 regarding Memorandum by 350 MPs demanding fresh inquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
2. Starred Q.No.284 answered on 17-5-66 regarding statement made by Shri Dwijendra Nath Bose that Netaji was alive and that he would come to India in March, 1966.
3. Unstarred Q.No.265 answered on 2-8-66 regarding setting up of a Committee by the Government of Formosa to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.
4. Starred Q.No.51, answered on 17-8-65 regarding statement made by Dr. S.N. Sinha, a former M.P., in Calcutta that Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had been kept in Cell No.46 in a prison in Siberia.

Government of India have already stated in the Parliament several times, in answers to Questions detailed above, that the findings of the Netaji Enquiry Committee, headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, submitted to the Government in 1956 have been accepted by the Government and that there was no necessity to institute a fresh enquiry since the report was conclusive.

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.855

LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.855

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 1ST AUGUST, 1966

NETAJI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE

QUESTION

No.855 SHRI BIBHUTI MISHRA: Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

- (a) whether the Government of Formosa have set up a Commission to inquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose from the airport;
- (b) whether this has been done at the instance of the private agencies; and
- (c) if so, the reaction of Government thereto?

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SARDAR SWARAN SINGH)

- (a) The Government of India have seen press reports stating that an officer of the Government of Formosa "has been directed to investigate the mystery of the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose".
- (b) According to Press reports this has been done at the instance of certain individuals in India.
- (c) The Government of India have no diplomatic relations with the Government in Taiwan and have no connection with any investigation reportedly ordered by that Government. It has been stated several times in Parliament that the Government of India have accepted the findings of the Netaji Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan.

LOK SABHA

STARRED QUESTION NO.228

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 3RD APRIL, 1967.

PROBE INTO THE DEATH OF NETAJI SUBHASH CHANDRA BOSE

QUESTION

NO.228

SHRI MADHU LIMAYE:
SHRI RAM KISHAN GUPTA:
SHRI S. KUNDU:
SHRI BAIDHAR BEHERA:

SHRI SRINIVAS MISRA:
SHRI SAMAR GUHA:
SHRI MOHAN SWARUP:

Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the statement of the retired Japanese Lt. General Fujiwara, who was attached to the I.N.A. about a probe into the circumstances surrounding the 'death' of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose;
- (b) whether Government propose to take the initiative in setting up a Joint Indo-Japanese probe team; and
- (c) if not, the reasons therefor?

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SHRI M.C. CHAGLA)

- (a) Yes, Sir.
- (b) No, Sir.
- (c) It will be recalled that an Official Enquiry Committee was appointed in 1956 to investigate the facts relating to the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. The Committee, after examining all the evidence, had presented a report which established that Netaji had actually died in an air accident in 1945. The Government are convinced that the report is accurate and there is no need for further enquiry. Lt. General Fujiwara has not come forward with any new facts.

LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO. 4338

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 3RD JULY, 1967

INVESTIGATIONS ABOUT THE DEATH OF
NETAJI SUBHASH CHANDRA BOSE

QUESTION

No. 4338 SHRI PRAKASH VIR SHASTRI:
SHRI H. P. CHATTERJEE:
SHRI S. C. SAMANTA:
SHRI DATTATRAYA KUNTE:
SHRI YASHPAL SINGH: Will the Minister of

External Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Government of Taiwan have assured their co-operation in carrying out investigations at Taiwan, where Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose is reported to have met his death in an air-crash;

(b) if so, whether Government propose to send some Committee or a Delegation with a view to finding out the factual position in respect of the air-crash; and

(c) if so, when a decision would be taken in this behalf?

....

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SHRI M. C. CHAGLA)

(a) Government of India have not received any such assurance from the Government of Taiwan.

(b)&(c): It has been stated in the Parliament several times that the Government of India have accepted the findings of the Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan which came to the conclusion that Netaji had actually died in an air-crash in 1945. The Government of India are convinced that there is no need for future enquiry.

.....

STARRED QUESTION NO.1334

LOK SABHA

STARRED QUESTION NO.1334

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 24TH JULY, 1967

FRESH ENQUIRY INTO THE DEATH OF NETAJI
SUBHASH CHANDRA BOSE

QUESTION

<u>*No.1334</u>	<u>SHRI PRAKASH VIR SHASTRI:</u>	<u>SHRI ARJAN SINGH</u>
	<u>SHRI RAGHUVIR SINGH SHASTRI:</u>	<u>BHADORIA:</u>
	<u>DR. SURYA PRAKASH PURI:</u>	<u>SHRI SREEKANTAN NAIR:</u>
	<u>SHRI SAMAR GUHA:</u>	<u>SHRI MOLAHU PRASAD:</u>
	<u>SHRI MAHANT DIGVIJAI NATH:</u>	<u>DR. KARNI SINGH:</u>
		<u>SHRI N.C. CHATTERJEE:</u>

Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to refer to the reply given to Unstarred Question No.4338 on the 3rd July, 1967 and state:

- (a) whether it is a fact that the Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan did not at all visit Taiwan, where Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose is reported to have met his death in an air-crash;
- (b) if so, how the Committee reached the conclusion that Netaji had actually died in an air-crash in 1945;
- (c) whether Government now propose to reopen the whole matter and institute a fresh enquiry in co-operation with the Government of Taiwan; and
- (d) if not, the reasons therefor?

.....

ANSWER

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH)

- (a) Yes, Sir.
- (b) The evidence on which the Committee reached the conclusion that Netaji had actually died in an air-crash in

1945 is too lengthy to be stated here. It can be found in the report of the Shah Nawaz Committee which has already been published.

(c) No, Sir.

(d) The Government are convinced that there is no need for any further enquiry because the report of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee is conclusive.

.....

STARRED QUESTION N 582

LOK SABHA

STARRED QUESTION NO.582

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 11TH DECEMBER 1967

NETAJI'S DEATH

QUESTION

*No.582 SHRI SAMAR GUHA: Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that in reply to a letter from Shri Suresh Chandra Bose (13.5.62) the late Prime Minister, Jawaharlal Nehru wrote inter alia that ' I cannot send you a direct and precise proof ... of the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose but circumstantial evidence has convinced us the fact that Netaji has died';

(b) whether it is also a fact that few weeks before his demise the late Prime Minister, Jawaharlal Nehru in reply to a letter from Shri Amiya Nath Bose, a member of the present Lok Sabha, assured him that some further steps should be taken to reach a finality regarding the controversy about Netaji's death; and

(c) if so, whether Government propose to send an investigation committee to Formosa to reach a finality about Netaji's death?

-.-.-.-

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY
OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI B.R. BHAGAT)

(a) In his letter of 13th May, 1962 to Shri Suresh Bose, Prime Minister Nehru wrote as follows:-

"You ask me to send you proof of the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's report has convinced us of the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly somewhere when he would be welcomed in India with great joy and affection, adds to that circumstantial evidence."

In reply to a subsequent letter from Shri Suresh Bose, Prime Minister Nehru wrote to him on 12th August, 1962 as follows:-

"I wrote to you that all the circumstantial evidence made me believe that Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had died. Much of this evidence was given in the report made by the Committee appointed for this purpose, which visited Japan. You will find the date, place and circumstances mentioned in that Committee's Report.

Apart from that report, the length of time that has elapsed is itself confirmatory of the fact of his death."

(b) He gave no assurance. In reply to a letter from Shri Amiya Nath Bose, Prime Minister Nehru wrote on April 22, 1964 as follows:-

"I agree with you that something should be done to finalise the question of Netaji's death. But it is not quite clear to me how far it will be proper for me to ask the Chief Justice of India to look into this matter. It may involve visiting Japan and I am sure I cannot ask the Chief Justice to do so."

(c) The Government of India have stated in reply to various questions in this house in subsequent years that there was no need for a further enquiry because the report of the Shah Nawaz Committee was conclusive.

NOTE FOR SUPPLEMENTARIES

(On Lok Sabha Starred Question No.582 for 11-12-1967)

.....

In response to the public demand that all the facts relating to the last stages of Netaji's life should be enquired into and made known, an Enquiry Committee was appointed by the Government of India in April, 1956. The Committee consisted of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, (elder brother of Netaji) and Shri S.N. Maitra, Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar Islands. The report of this Committee which was signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra, was released for publication in September, 1956. The Government of India accepted the report. The third member, namely, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose did not sign the report. Later on he submitted a separate report dissenting from the findings of the majority report. After laying a copy of this report on the Table of the House on 11.9.1956, the late Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, made a statement in the Lok Sabha in which he said inter alia that Government felt that the evidence adduced in the report was practically overwhelming and should be accepted. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji met his death as a result of an air crash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945 and that his ashes are now at the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo.

2. Since the Shah Nawaz Committee Report was published, demands have been made both in Parliament and elsewhere on several occasions that another Enquiry Committee be appointed. The suggestion for this was due to the fact that one of the members, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, the brother of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, did not agree with the findings and submitted a dissentient report. The Government of India, however, have consistently taken the position that neither the dissentient report nor the evidence which Shri Bose had referred justified the view that the findings of the Commission required revision, and have, therefore, refused to order another enquiry. The last time such a request was made was

in 1965 when press reports from Formosa suggesting that the Nationalist Chinese Government have set up a Committee provoked a Parliamentary Question on August 2, 1966, from Shri Chitta Basu. At that time, the Foreign Minister repeated that "it has been stated several times in Parliament that the Government of India have accepted the findings of the Netaji Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan."

3. In 1962, a controversy was started stating that the Sanyasi of Shaulmari Ashram was Netaji. This has been indignantly denied by the Sanyasi himself and reiterated in a Bengali leaflet issued by the Ashram.

4. Dr. Satya Narain Sinha came up with a statement that Netaji was at present incarcerated in Cell No.46 of Yakutsk prison in Siberia. The statement is difficult to verify and the Government have absolutely no information to corroborate this view.

5. More recently Lt. General (Retired) Fujiwara who claims to have discovered a presentation sword owned by Netaji in a Tokyo curio shop and who came to India to present this relic suggested an Indo-Japanese Committee to go into the question of Netaji's death to arrive at a conclusion "once and for all". Unfortunately the General has not specified the nature of his doubts and it is also relevant to note the fact of his long silence and that he did not come forth as a witness in front of the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee.

6. Although the Committee did not go to Formosa for political reasons, they met a large number of very relevant witnesses including Col. Habibur Rahman (Netaji's co-traveller on the fatal trip) and several Japanese army and civil doctors, officials and nurses who returned to Tokyo after the war. As Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri and the present Prime Minister have often reiterated, the Government of India have accepted the findings of the Shah Nawaz Committee in toto and consider the evidence adduced by them to be overwhelmingly conclusive of Netaji's death. In the fact of the lack of any fresh evidence, there is no reason for the Government to agree to undertake the task of appointing a new Committee to go into what they already accepted as being the truth.

LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.3719

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 11TH DECEMBER, 1967

ENQUIRY ABOUT NETAJI'S DEATH

QUESTION

No.3719 SHRI SAMAR GUHA: Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that while presenting Netaji's sword to Netaji National Museum in Calcutta, last year, General Fuziara, a Japanese General of eminence declared that Japan will gladly agree to cooperate with any effort undertaken by the Government of India to arrive at a finality about Netaji mystery;

(b) whether it is also a fact that Shri H.V. Kamath, a former Member of Lok Sabha, after his visit to Formosa last year said in a press statement that the Government of Formosa was conducting an enquiry about the reported plane crash involving Netaji at Taipah in 1945 and it was prepared to undertake a joint enquiry along with the Government of India about the aforesaid matter; and

(c) if so, whether the Government of India, in collaboration with the Government of Japan and the Government of Formosa will institute a fresh Enquiry Committee to finally resolve the Netaji mystery?

ANSWER

THE PRIME MINISTER AND MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI)

(a) The Government have seen press reports of statement said to have been made by General Fuziara who was visiting India in his private capacity.

(b) The Government have also seen press reports of statement reported to have been made by Shri Kamath.

(c) Government have indicated on earlier occasions that there is no necessity to institute a fresh enquiry since the report presented by the Shah Nawaz Committee was conclusive.

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.1408

LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.1408

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 21ST FEBRUARY, 1968

FRESH INQUIRY INTO THE REPORTED DEATH OF NETAJI

QUESTION

No.1408 SHRI D.C. SHARMA: Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

- (a) whether a large number of Members of Parliament have demanded a fresh inquiry into the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in a memorandum submitted to the President;
- (b) whether the demand has been looked into; and
- (c) if so, with what results?

ANSWER

THE PRIME MINISTER & MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI)

(a)&(b): Yes, Sir.

- (c) Government have accepted the conclusion of the Official Enquiry Committee appointed in 1956 that Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose met his death in an air crash in the year 1945. Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted.

Sent to Lstt. of Parliamentary Affairs
Wld REA.O/M No. C/125/5/69
of 26/7/69

Seventh Session, 1969 of the LOK SABHA
Ministry of External Affairs

Date and Reference	Subject	Promise made	When and how fulfilled	Remarks
Unstarred Question No. 5150 dated 2nd April, 1969, by Shri Samar Guha, and Shri Beni Shanker Sharma.	<p>Asking</p> <p>(a) whether attention of Govt. has been drawn to a report published in a Calcutta daily "Jugantar" on the 6th March, 1969 regarding the escape of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose from Singapore on the eve of the Japanese surrender;</p> <p>(b) whether in that report, a retired armyman now serving the Police Department of the Govt. of West Bengal disclosed on the basis of his personal knowledge that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose did not fly to Taihoko in Formosa by a plane, instead he escaped with two Japanese in a submarine and left for an unknown destination;</p> <p>(c) whether Govt. tried to contact the said Officer and verify from him the veracity of the report published in his name in the said Calcutta daily; and</p> <p>(d) If so, the facts relevant to the report and if not, whether Government will make an immediate enquiry into the reported matter and let the House know full facts about it.</p>	<p>(c) & (d)</p> <p>Necessary enquiries are being made and the conclusions, when reached, will be intimated to the House.</p>	<p>(c) & (d)</p> <p>The officer concerned was contacted and the statement made by him examined in detail. It is found that</p> <p>(i) the statement which appeared in the "Jugantar" dated the 4th March, 1969 was based on the alleged remarks of a Japanese</p>	

Date and Reference	Subject	Promise made	When and how fulfilled	Remarks
			<p>soldier, who claimed to have worked as attendant and driver of Netaji, and is in the nature of hearsay: The officer himself did not witness the event.</p> <p>(ii) the date etc. of the journey mentioned is imprecise in as much as he refers to "end of 1945"</p> <p>(iii) the statement made cannot be corroborated by any factual details and does not contradict the findings of the Shah Nawaz Committee.</p>	

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.4192

LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.4192

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 20TH AUGUST, 1969

REPORTED BROADCAST BY NETAJI SUBHAS
CHANDRA BOSE FROM RADIO MOSCOW

QUESTION

No.4192 SHRI SAMAR GUHA:

Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a report published in a Hindi periodical Biswa Neta, printed and published from Delhi, to the effect that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose made a broadcast over Moscow Radio after the signing of the Tashkent Pact;
- (b) whether the same periodical has published the photostatic copy of the reply by the Soviet Embassy, New Delhi concerning the matter; and
- (c) if so, whether any enquiry into the published report will be made and if so, when?

ANSWER

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH)

(a)&(b): Yes, Sir. The photostat copy of the letter from Radio Moscow mentions the name "Subhas Chandra" and not "Subhas Chandra Bose".

(c) Our Embassy in Moscow has checked up with Moscow Radio authorities who have stated that the broadcast was made by an Indian student named Subhas Chandra.

STARRED QUESTION NO.284

RAJYA SABHA

STARRED QUESTION NO.284

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 17TH MAY, 1966

NEWS ABOUT NETAJI

QUESTION

*No.284 SHRI R.K. BHUWALKA: Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a news item appearing in the Hindustan Times dated the 7th March, 1966 under the caption "Netaji still alive";
- (b) if the answer to part (a) above be in the affirmative whether any information is being collected in this regard; and
- (c) if so, what are the details thereof?

.....

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SARDAR SWARAN SINGH)

- (a) Yes, Sir.
- (b)&(c): The Enquiry Committee which was appointed in 1956 to investigate the facts relating to the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had established that Netaji had actually died in an air accident in 1945. The Government have accepted these findings and have not come across any further information that would contradict the findings of the Enquiry Committee.

NOTE FOR SUPPLEMENTARIES

(On Rajya Sabha Starred Question No. 284 for 17.5.1966)

.....

In response to the public demand that all the facts relating to the last stages of Netaji's life should be enquired into and made known, an Enquiry Committee was appointed by the Government of India in April, 1956. The Committee consisted of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, (elder brother of Netaji) and Shri S.N.Maitra, Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar Islands. The report of this Committee which was signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N.Maitra, was released for publication in September, 1956. The Government of India accepted the report. The third member, namely, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose did not sign the report. Later on he submitted a separate report dissenting from the findings of the majority report. After laying a copy of this report on the Table of the House on 11.9.1956, the late Prime Minister, Shri Jawahar Lal Nehru, made a statement in the Lok Sabha in which he said inter alia that Government felt that the evidence adduced in the report was practically overwhelming and should be accepted. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji met his death as a result of an air crash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945 and that his ashes are now at the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo.

Certain elements, particularly in West Bengal and especially some members of the Netaji's family, have been maintaining that Netaji is still alive. In February this year Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, elder brother of Netaji, made a statement at Madurai saying that "Netaji is alive today" and that Netaji should be back in India in March. An unstarred Question asking for the reaction of Government to that statement came up in the Lok Sabha on 14.3.1966 to which the Foreign Minister's reply was:

.....2/-

"the Enquiry Committee which was appointed in 1956 to investigate the facts relating to the reported death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had established that Netaji had actually died in an air accident in 1945. The Government has accepted the findings of this Committee". Another such statement is reported to have been made by Shri Dwijendranath Bose, nephew of Netaji and General Secretary of the All-India Forward Bloc stating that Netaji was still alive and was working in a place very near the borders of India. He further said that Netaji is "still working for India. He will come out into the open and enter India at the appropriate time in such a way that he can establish a new order in the country".

The Government's position in this regard has already been made clear in the Parliament on a number of occasions including the one cited above. The Government have no further information on this, nor do the Government propose to hold another enquiry in the matter.

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.265

RAJYA SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO.265

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 2ND AUGUST, 1966

FORMOSAN ENQUIRY ABOUT NETAJI

QUESTION

No.265 SHRI CHITTA BASU: Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government are aware that the Government of Formosa have set up a committee to enquire into the disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in 1945; and
(b) if so, whether Government propose to associate with that enquiry?

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
(SARDAR SWARAN SINGH)

(a) Yes, Sir.
(b) Government of India have no diplomatic relations with the Government of Taiwan. Further, it has been stated several times in Parliament that the Government of India have accepted the findings of the Netaji Enquiry Committee headed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan.

STARRED QUESTION NO.325

RAJYA SABHA

STARRED QUESTION NO.325

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 29TH FEBRUARY, 1968

NETAJI SUBHASH CHANDRA BOSE

QUESTION

Ans
*No.325 SARDAR NARINDER SINGH BRAR: Will the Prime Minister be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government have received any memorandum signed by 350 Members of Parliament urging the Union Government to appoint a Committee of Enquiry with collaboration of the Governments of Japan and Taiwan to clear the mystery about Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose; and
- (b) if so, what are the main features of the memorandum and Government's reaction thereto?

.....

ANSWER

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI B.R. BHAGAT)

- (a) Yes, Sir.
- (b) Apart from demanding a fresh enquiry into the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose the memorandum suggests certain steps to accord due honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji.

Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any further enquiry into the death of Netaji is warranted.

The suggestions for according due honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji are being examined.

NOTE FOR SUPPLEMENTARIES

(On Rajya Sabha Starred Question No. 325 for 29.2.1968)

.....

Memorandum by some 350 M.Ps. for appointing a fresh Enquiry Committee to investigate into the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose and according due honour to his personality

A memorandum, said to have been signed by nearly 350 Members of Parliament, was submitted to the President urging that due honour and recognition to the personality and leadership of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose should be accorded by undertaking the following:

1. To place his portrait in the Central Hall of Parliament and all offices of the Government;
2. To erect a statue of Netaji on a prominent site in New Delhi, preferably at India Gate;
3. To devise suitable means to accord national recognition to military genius of Netaji;
4. To observe his birthday every year with due solemnity;
5. To erect suitable memorials at Kohima and Imphal in honour of I.N.A. heroes who sacrificed their lives in the liberation struggle under the leadership of Netaji;
6. To publish the Volume on I.N.A., already written for the "History of Indian Army During the Second War", published by the Government;
7. To give him his due place in the "History of the Freedom Movement" (planned by Government of India). (For this it is necessary to take expert advice on the portion of the manuscript relating to him before it is finally approved for the press).
8. To arrange publication of Netaji's writings and speeches.

The memorandum then goes on to suggest "that a further enquiry be made with the collaboration of the Governments of Japan and Taiwan by a small independent committee consisting of a Judge of the Supreme Court and two or three public men..."

Official Enquiry conducted in 1956

In response to the public demand that all the facts relating to the last stages of Netaji's life should be enquired into and made known, an Enquiry Committee was appointed by the Government of India in April, 1956. The Committee consisted of Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose (elder brother of Netaji) and Shri S.N. Maitra, Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar Islands. The report of this Committee, which was signed by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan and Shri S.N. Maitra, was released for publication in September, 1956. The Government of India accepted the report. The conclusion reached by the Enquiry Committee was that Netaji met his death as a result of an air crash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945 and that his ashes are now at the Renkoji Temple in Tokyo. However, the third member, namely, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, did not sign the report. Later on, he submitted a separate report dissenting from the findings of the majority report. After laying a copy of this report on the Table of the House on 11.9.1956, the late Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, made a statement in the Lok Sabha in which he said inter alia that Government felt that the evidence adduced in the report was practically overwhelming and should be accepted.

Government's attitude to repeated requests for further probes

There have been repeated requests and demands on several occasions for undertaking another enquiry. However, Government having accepted the findings of the Shah Nawaz Committee have taken the view that unless fresh evidence or new facts were brought to light, another enquiry was unwarranted. In the Rajya Sabha itself in 1966, in answer to Starred Question No.284 on 17.5.1966 and again in reply to unstarred question No.265 on 2.8.1966, the Government reiterated this viewpoint. Assertions that Swami Sharananand of the Sholmari

Ashram was, in fact, Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose had been denied by the Swami himself. Another claim made by Dr. S.N. Sinha that Netaji was incarcerated in cell No.46 of Yakutusk prison in Siberia has not been corroborated by any tangible evidence. Recently, Lt.-General Fujiwara of Japan , who came to India to present Netaji's sword, requested that the matter should be investigated "once and for all". The General, however, has not produced any evidence which would warrant any further enquiry. The memorandum too refers to press reports of hearsay evidence published in 1945 and early 1956. These hearsay reports cannot warrant a fresh enquiry. It would be relevant to mention that Prime Minister, Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, had in a letter to Shri Suresh Chandra Bose on May 13, 1962 said: "I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's Report has convinced us of the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly when he would be welcome in India with great joy and affection adds to that circumstantial evidence".

Correspondence between Shri Jawaharlal Nehru and Shri Suresh Bose and Shri Amiya Bose regarding further enquiry

A set of the letters exchanged between Prime Minister Nehru and Shri Suresh Bose or Shri Amiya Bose are enclosed.

It is true that in his letter of April 22, 1964 Prime Minister Nehru 'agreed' with Shri Amiya Bose that something should be done to "finalise the question of Netaji's death". But he gave no assurance and there is nothing to suggest, in the context of the entire correspondence, that at any time Prime Minister Nehru had

entertained doubts about the conclusive character of the evidence cited by the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee or others to establish Netaji's death. Presumably, what Shri Nehru had in mind was that something should be done to persuade those who still doubted this fact to accept the finality of the conclusion that Netaji was no more.

Decision on the Memorandum

The memorandum was discussed at a meeting of Secretaries held under the chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on the 17th February, 1968, to examine the various points raised. As far as the question of a fresh enquiry was concerned, the meeting was of the view that this was not warranted as no fresh evidence had been brought to light. This recommendation was brought to the Prime Minister's notice in connection with unstarred question No.1408 which was answered in the Lok Sabha on 21.2.1968. In reply to the question, the Prime Minister had stated: "Since no new facts have been brought to light, Government do not consider that any fresh enquiry is warranted".

The suggestions in the memorandum for according honour and recognition to the personality of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose too were examined in the meeting and the recommendations of the meeting, contained in the minutes, have been submitted to the Home Minister and the Prime Minister for approval.

Suresh C. Bose.

Dated 12th May, 1962.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru,
Prime Minister of India,
New Delhi.

Dear Shri Nehru,

The report in the papers of the 8th instant is to the effect that you stated in Parliament on the previous day, in reply to a question by Shri P.C. Baroosh that the majority report of the Netaji Enquiry Committee established that my brother Shri Subhas Chandra Bose, died in an air-accident.

If you hold this piece of news to be correct, it affects the members of our family more than the general public, who, however, are also deeply interested in its correctness or otherwise.

I would, therefore, request you as his elder brother and as the seniormost surviving member of the family to forward to me the proof of his death, circumstances under which such alleged death took place.

In the expectation of a reply and with kind regards,

I remain,

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Suresh C. Bose
12.5.62.

No.704-PMH/62

May 13, 1962.

Dear Shri Suresh Bose,

I have your letter of the 12th May. You ask me to send you proof of the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. I cannot send you any precise and direct proof. But all the circumstantial evidence that has been produced and which has been referred to in the Enquiry Committee's report has convinced us to the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this, the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly somewhere when he would be welcomed in India with great joy and affection, adds to that circumstantial evidence.

Yours sincerely,

Sd/-Jawaharlal Nehru

Shri Suresh C.Bose,
Garia,
P.O.Garia,
Distt. 24 Paraganas,
West Bengal.

SURESH C. BOSE

Garia, P.O. Garia,
Dist. 24 Parganas,
(West Bengal),
Dated 8th August, 1962.

Dear Shri Nehru,

It appears from your letter No. 982-PMH/62 of the 26th June last, that your own information conveyed to you by our Ambassadors has confirmed the fact that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose is dead.

As this piece of news, if true, virtually affects all the members of our family. I would respectfully request you to please forward to me the date, place and circumstances under which the alleged death took place, as reported to you.

With kind regards,

I remain,
Yours sincerely,
Suresh Chandra Bose.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru,
Prime Minister,
New Delhi.

No.1256-PMH/62

August 12, 1962

Dear Shri Bose,

I have your letter of the 8th August, I wrote to you that all the circumstantial evidence made me believe that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose had died. Much of this evidence was given in the report made by the Committee appointed for this purpose, which visited Japan. You will find the date, place and circumstances mentioned in that committee's report.

Apart from that report, the length of time that has elapsed is itself confirmatory of the fact of his death.

Yours sincerely,

Jawaharlal Nehru.

Shri Suresh C. Bose,
Garia,
P.O. Garia,
Dist. 24 Parganas.

1, WOODBURN PARK
CALCUTTA 20

My dear Panditji,

26. 4. 1964

With reference to our talk in Delhi recently, I would like to submit to you the following proposals for your consideration.

The controversy regarding the aircrash at Taikoku in August 1945 is having unfortunate consequences. The report of the Enquiry Committee consisting of Shah Nawaz Khan and two other members has not found acceptance among a large section of the Indian people. The main reason for this is to be found in the fact that the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee did not include any person of high judicial standing and experience. Irresponsible statements by a number of persons are also keeping this controversy alive. In the national interest there should be a final judicial finding regarding the aircrash at Thaihoku in August 1945. It will be in the fitness of things if the Chief Justice of India will agree to preside over a body of Judges and enquire into this question. All the materials collected by the Shah Nawaz Enquiry Committee on the subject and other materials that may be available to the Government of India should be placed at the disposal of this body of Judges. This body should, of course, be at liberty to take any further evidence on the subject if that is considered necessary by it and if such evidence is available.

The Government should accept the findings of this judicial body and take whatever steps that may be found necessary on the basis of its recommendations. This being purely a national question the Government should not take into account the opinion of any individual in this matter even though he happens to be related to Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose.

I shall be thankful if you will kindly send me your message in support of the plans of Netaji Hall society.

Hope you are feeling better.

With regards,

Yours sincerely,

Sd/- Amiya Nath Bose.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru,
Prime Minister of India,
New Delhi.

No.293-PMH/64

April 22, 1964.

My dear Amiya,

I have your letter of the 20th April, I agree with you that something should be done to finalise the question of Netaji's death. But it is not quite clear to me how far it will be proper for me to ask the Chief Justice of India to look into this matter. It may involve visiting Japan, and I am sure I cannot ask the Chief Justice to do so.

I have sent you a brief message already about the Netaji Hall Society.

Yours sincerely,

Jawaharlal Nehru.

Shri Amiya Nath Bose,
1, Woodburn Park.
Calcutta-20.

A BRIEF ON THE RESOLUTION FOR INSTITUTING
A FRESH ENQUIRY TO PROBE THE CIRCUMSTANCES
LEADING TO DISAPPEARANCE OF NETAJI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE

Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose was reported to have died in an air crash on the 18th August, 1945 at the Taihoku airfield in Formosa. His body was cremated at the Taihoku Crematorium on the 20th August, 1945. The ashes were flown to Tokyo and they have been lying in the Renkoji Temple since then.

Some doubts were expressed in regard to Netaji's death and in response to a demand from a section of the public, the Government of India set up a Committee in April 1956 to enquire in the matter. The Committee consisted of the following:-

1. Shri Shah Nawaz Khan
2. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose
3. Shri S.N. Maitra

The Committee reached a conclusion that Netaji met his death as a result of an aircrash at Taihoku airfield in Formosa on August 18, 1945.

While Shri Suresh Chandra Bose signed on 2.7.1956 on the principal conclusions agreed to for the draft report, which confirmed that Netaji did in fact meet his death in the above aircrash, he did not, however, sign the final report of the Committee. Instead, Shri Suresh Chandra Bose submitted a dissentient report stating that there had been no plane crash involving Netaji's death as concluded in the enquiry Committee's Report. The dissentient report of Shri Suresh Chandra was placed on the Table of the House in October, 1956. Government of India considered the majority report of the

Enquiry Committee and accepted its findings that Netaji had in fact met his death as a result of an aircrash and the House was informed accordingly by the then Prime Minister, late Shri Nehru.

Despite the findings of the Enquiry Committee and the lack of any new evidence on Netaji's survival, there have been repeated requests and demands on several occasions for undertaking a fresh enquiry in the matter. The matter was dealt with in the Rajya Sabha twice in 1966 - in answer to Starred Question No.284 on 17.5.66 and again in reply to an unstarred question No.2651 of 2.8.1966. Again the matter was dealt in the Rajya Sabha in response to a Starred Question No.325 on 29.2.1968, which was based upon the Memorandum purported to have been signed by nearly 350 Members of the Parliament urging the Government to Institute a fresh enquiry in the matter. The Government of India had stated on all these occasions that no new facts had been brought to light which would warrant further enquiry into the death of Netaji.

There have, no doubt, been occasional rumours and press reports based on hear say evidence from time to time contradicting the findings of enquiry Committee report of 1956. But there has been no tangible evidence or new facts available to warrant a fresh enquiry in the matter. The circumstantial evidence produced by the Enquiry Committee's report is convincing enough of the fact that Netaji has died. In addition to this the lapse of time now and the extreme improbability of his being alive secretly when he would be welcome in India with great joy and affection adds to that circumstantial evidence.

Once again there has been one more resolution Tabled by Shri Benoy Krishna Daschowdhury proposing to institute a fresh enquiry Commission presided over by a judge of the Supreme Court of India about the disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose since August, 1945.

Government of India feels that till this day there has been no fresh evidence available, nor any new facts revealed which warrant a fresh enquiry in the matter. Government considers that the findings of the Enquiry Committee in 1956 were based upon all the possible circumstantial evidence that had been available. In the absence of any new facts a fresh enquiry at this stage is not warranted.

One of the recommendations of the earlier Memorandum submitted by some 350 members of the Parliament in early 1968 was that due honour and recognition to the personality and leadership of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose be accorded by undertaking the following:-

1. To place his portrait in the Central Hall of Parliament and all offices of the Government;
2. To erect a statue of Netaji on a prominent site in New Delhi, preferably at India Gate.
3. To devise suitably means to accord national recognition to military genius of Netaji.
4. To observe his birthday every year with due solemnity;
5. To erect suitable memorials at Kohima and Imphal in honour of I.N.A. heroes who sacrificed their lives in the liberation struggle under the leadership of Netaji;
6. To publish the volume of I.N.A., already written for the "History of Indian Army during the Second Wary" published by the Government;
7. To give him his due place in the "History of the Freedom Movement" (planned by Government of India). (For this it is necessary to take expert advice on the portion of the manuscript relating to him before it is finally approved for the press).
8. To arrange publication of Netaji's writings and speeches.

These suggestions were examined in the meeting of the Secretaries held under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary on the 17th February 1968 and the recommendations of this meeting have been submitted to the Home Minister and the Prime Minister for approval. The Ministry of Home Affairs would be taking necessary steps to honour and commemorate the personality of Netaji.

...

Manjit Singh,
DIRECTOR (EA)

No. C/551/10/69/JP

August 23, 1969

My dear Prem,

Will you kindly refer to your letter
No. 10/21/CF-69 of August 19, 1969?

2. As desired, I enclose a note which will explain the repeated demands made in Parliament for holding further enquiries into the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. I should like to add that a Private Member's Resolution is coming up on August 29th in Rajya Sabha, seeking the setting up of an Enquiry Commission. The relevant papers are being put up to the Foreign Minister and a decision on the demand raised in the Resolution will be taken by him, on Monday the 25th August.

With kind regards,

Yours sincerely,

S/ (Manjit Singh)

Shri P.P. Caprihan,
Deputy Secretary,
Cabinet Secretariat,
(Dept. of Cabinet Affairs)
Rashtrapati Bhavan,
New Delhi.